

CHAPTER 5: CONSULTATION AND COORDINATION

This Page Intentionally Left Blank

Chapter 5

Consultation and Coordination

Table of Contents

5.1 Introduction	5-1
5.2 Consultation with the Tribes	5-2
5.2.1 Shoshone-Bannock Tribes.....	5-2
5.2.2 Shoshone-Paiute Tribes.....	5-2
5.3 Coordination with Federal Government Agencies	5-3
5.4 Coordination with State and Local Government Agencies	5-4
5.5 Additional Collaboration Efforts.....	5-5
5.5.1 Newsletters.....	5-5
5.5.2 Website	5-5
5.5.3 Scoping	5-5
5.5.4 Public Meetings	5-6
5.5.5 Briefings and Presentations	5-6
5.6 Public Comments of the Draft RMP/EIS.....	5-8
5.7 List of Preparers.....	5-10

List of Tables

Table 5-1. State and Local Government Agencies Invited to Establish Cooperating Agency Status for the Jarbidge RMP	5-4
Table 5-2. Open House Scoping Meeting Schedule and Attendance	5-5
Table 5-3. Draft RMP/EIS Open House Schedule and Attendance	5-8
Table 5-4. Public Comment Summary	5-9
Table 5-5. List of Preparers.....	5-10

This Page Intentionally Left Blank

5.1 INTRODUCTION

The Bureau of Land Management (BLM) planning processes for the Jarbidge Resource Management Plan (RMP) Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) were conducted in accordance with the requirements of the National Environmental Policy Act of 1969 (NEPA), Council on Environmental Quality (CEQ) regulations, and Department of the Interior (DOI) and BLM policies and regulations. NEPA and the associated regulatory/policy framework require Federal agencies to involve interested publics in their decision-making processes. Title II, Section 202 of the Federal Land Policy and Management Act of 1976 (FLPMA) directs BLM to coordinate planning efforts with American Indian Tribes, other Federal agencies, and State and local governments as part of its land use planning process. This chapter documents the collaborative approach undertaken by BLM throughout the development of the Jarbidge Draft RMP/EIS and Proposed RMP/Final EIS.

5.2 CONSULTATION WITH THE TRIBES

5.2.1 Shoshone-Bannock Tribes

Formal government-to-government consultation with the Shoshone-Bannock Tribes is conducted through the Fort Hall Business Council and is coordinated with the Shoshone-Bannock environmental staff. A brief introduction to the Jarbidge RMP was given to the Fort Hall Business Council on April 27, 2006. A presentation on the Jarbidge Draft RMP/EIS was given to tribal environmental staff on June 26, 2008. A presentation on the Jarbidge Proposed RMP/Final EIS was given to tribal environmental staff on August 22, 2011.

5.2.2 Shoshone-Paiute Tribes

Consultation on the Jarbidge RMP with the Shoshone-Paiute Tribes is conducted through the Twin Falls District's established government-to-government consultation process, the Wings and Roots Native American Campfire. The Jarbidge RMP was briefly discussed at Wings and Roots meetings between December 2005 and September 2006. The Shoshone-Paiute Tribal Staff toured the southern portion of the planning area with Jarbidge Field Office staff on August 10, 2006. Consultation with the Shoshone-Paiute Tribes for the Jarbidge RMP/EIS began in October 2006 and continued on a monthly basis throughout the planning process.

5.3 COORDINATION WITH FEDERAL GOVERNMENT AGENCIES

The following Federal government agencies were invited to participate in the RMP planning process as cooperating agencies:

- Mountain Home Air Force Base;
- National Park Service – Hagerman Fossil Beds National Monument;
- Natural Resources Conservation Service;
- US Fish and Wildlife Service (FWS) – Boise, ID and Reno, NV; and
- US Geological Survey – Forest and Rangeland Ecosystem Science Center and Water Resources Division.

The National Park Service-Hagerman Fossil Beds National Monument accepted the BLM's invitation, finalized a Memorandum of Understanding to formally establish the relationship and participated as a member of the Interdisciplinary Team (ID Team). The Natural Resources Conservation Service and the FWS, both Boise and Reno, formally declined the invitation to become a cooperating agency.

Members of the ID Team and the Twin Falls District managers conducted briefings and presentations on the Jarbidge RMP to a variety of Federal government agencies. These presentations and meetings included:

- Mountain Home Air Force Base (annually),
- FWS Bull Trout Recovery Team (various),
- FWS (various), and
- Humboldt-Toiyabe National Forest, Jarbidge Ranger District (September 2007).

5.4 COORDINATION WITH STATE AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT AGENCIES

A number of State and local government agencies were invited to participate in the RMP planning process as cooperating agencies (Table 5-1).

Table 5-1. State and Local Government Agencies Invited to Establish Cooperating Agency Status for the Jarbidge RMP

State Agencies	Local Agencies
Idaho Department of Fish and Game (IDFG)	Elko County Board of Commissioners
Idaho Department of Lands (IDL)	Elmore County Board of Commissioners
Idaho Department of Parks and Recreation (IDPR)	Owyhee County Commissioners
Idaho Department of Transportation (IDT)	Twin Falls County Commissioners
Idaho Department of Water Resources (IDWR)	
Idaho Governor's Office of Species Conservation	
Idaho State Department of Agriculture (ISDA)	
Idaho State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO)	

The IDFG, IDL, IDPR, ISDA, the Elko County Board of Commissioners, and the Twin Falls County Commissioners accepted the invitation and finalized Memorandums of Understanding to formally establish the relationship. Representatives from IDFG, IDL, IDPR, and ISDA participated as members of the Jarbidge RMP Interdisciplinary Team (ID Team). The Owyhee County Commissioners participated in the Jarbidge RMP through their existing coordination agreement with the Twin Falls District. The IDT, IDWR, and SHPO formally declined the invitation to become a cooperating agency. Both the Idaho Governor's Office of Species Conservation and Elmore County Board of Commissioners did not respond to the invitation.

Members of the ID Team and the Twin Falls District managers conducted briefings and presentations on the Jarbidge RMP to a variety of State and local government agencies. These presentations and meetings include:

- Owyhee County Commissioners (monthly);
- Nevada Division of Wildlife (April 2006);
- Elko County Board of Commissioners (August 2006, August 2007, September 2007, and October 2010); and
- Twin Falls County Commissioners (December 2006, July 2007, and October, 2010).

5.5 ADDITIONAL COLLABORATION EFFORTS

5.5.1 Newsletters

At the beginning of the Jarbidge RMP process, a mailing list was generated of individuals likely to be interested in the Jarbidge RMP. ID Team members compiled a mailing list for the RMP, including individuals and organizations on other BLM mailing lists; Jarbidge Field Office permit and lease holders; Tribes; Federal, State, and local government agencies; mailing list requests; and other individuals or organizations thought to be interested in the Jarbidge planning effort.

A newsletter was mailed in May 2006 with a reply card individuals could use to remain on the mailing list. Additional newsletters were mailed in September 2006, January 2007, and March 2007.

5.5.2 Website

First, an e-mail address and website for the RMP were created when the Notice of Intent to prepare the Jarbidge RMP was published. The website was developed to communicate information about the Jarbidge RMP. This website, located at http://www.blm.gov/id/st/en/prog/nepa_register/jarbidge-rmp-revision.html, contained the following informational pages:

- Why is this Plan being Prepared,
- Planning Process,
- How to get Involved and Comment,
- Public Meetings,
- News & Newsletters,
- Federal Register Notices,
- Planning Documents, and
- Photos.

5.5.3 Scoping

Scoping is the term used to describe the early and open process for identifying the issues to be addressed in the planning process. A Notice of Intent to prepare the Jarbidge RMP was published in the Federal Register on January 10, 2006. This notice served as the beginning of BLM's formal scoping process for the RMP.

Open house scoping meetings were held in Twin Falls, Buhl, Glens Ferry, and Three Creek, Idaho (ID), in May 2006. Fifty-six individuals participated in these meetings (Table 5-2). The open house format was used to encourage two-way dialogue and discussions about issues to be addressed in the plan, concerns about the process, the planning criteria, and the development of the range of alternatives to be analyzed in the Draft RMP/EIS. At each open house, at least five members of the Interdisciplinary Team (ID Team) plus at least one manager from the Twin Falls District were available to answer questions from the public. Maps and posters were displayed around the room to facilitate discussion between the BLM staff and the public. Some attendees submitted written comments at the open houses. In addition, following each open house, ID Team members documented the issues and concerns they discussed with various publics.

Table 5-2. Open House Scoping Meeting Schedule and Attendance

Location	Date	Number of Attendees
Twin Falls, ID	May 16, 2006	18
Buhl, ID	May 18, 2006	9
Glens Ferry, ID	May 23, 2006	17
Three Creek, ID	May 24, 2006	12

Several methods were used to advertise the open house meetings and the scoping period for the Jarbidge RMP. The RMP website provided information regarding the open houses and instructions for

submitting scoping comments. A one-page mailing was sent to the RMP mailing list on April 28, 2006, that informed recipients of the open house schedule and how to submit comments. These same parties were sent the Jarbidge RMP Newsletter on May 12, 2006. This newsletter provided more information about the planning process, public participation in the RMP, and the open house schedule; it also contained a postage-paid reply card that could be returned as a request to remain on the mailing list and be used to provide scoping comments¹. Copies of the newsletter were distributed to attendees at meetings and briefings and were also available to the public at the Jarbidge, Shoshone, and Burley Field Offices.

A press release on the open houses and scoping process was sent to contacts from the Twin Falls District Media Distribution List the week of May 8, 2006; two newspapers printed stories and one radio station aired a story based on the press release. The local CBS affiliate, KMVT, produced a short segment on the Jarbidge RMP that aired during the evening newscasts on May 15, 2006. Print ads were also placed in six newspapers prior to the open houses.

5.5.4 Public Meetings

In addition to the public meetings held for scoping, a Community Economic Profile workshop was held in Glens Ferry, ID, in September 2006 to present and get feedback on the findings of an economic analysis of the area by Dr. Richard Gardner; 14 people from a variety of agencies and organizations attended this workshop. A Data Fair was held in Twin Falls, ID, in January 2007 to give the public an opportunity to review the data used to develop the Jarbidge RMP. More than 75 people representing a wide array of Federal, State, and local government agencies, as well as the general public, attended to view the data and information used in developing the Jarbidge Draft RMP/EIS and talk with resource specialists.

The Twin Falls District Resource Advisory Council (RAC) hosted workshops about the Jarbidge RMP in April 2007. Workshops were planned to discuss alternative development, vegetation and livestock grazing, transportation, and areas for special designation or management. The workshop on vegetation and livestock grazing had 27 attendees, and 17 people attended the workshop on transportation. Due to a lack of interest, workshops on alternative development and areas for special designation or management were cancelled.

5.5.5 Briefings and Presentations

Members of the ID Team and the Twin Falls District managers conducted briefings and presentations on the Jarbidge RMP for a variety of groups. Many of these presentations were provided at regularly scheduled coordination meetings, and others were given at the group's request. These presentations and meetings included:

- Twin Falls District Resource Advisory Council (quarterly);
- Idaho Congressional Briefing (quarterly);
- "71" Livestock Association (bi-annually);
- Jarbidge Sage-Grouse Local Working Group (various);
- Twin Falls Chamber of Commerce Government Affairs Committee (May 2006);
- The Wilderness Society (June 2006);
- Idaho ATV Association Inc., Southern Idaho Desert Racing Association, Treasure Valley Trail Machine Association (July 2006);
- Buhl Kiwanis (July 2006);
- Twin Falls Monarch Lions Club (July 2006);
- Mid-Snake Resource Conservation and Development Council (July 2006);
- Mayors, Administrators, and City Councils Organization (July 2006);
- Twin Falls County Fair (August 30 through September 4, 2006);

¹ To avoid sending unwanted mail, those who had not participated in scoping either by submitting comments, attending an open house or briefing, or requesting to remain on the mailing list were removed from the mailing list. Organizations, government agencies, and holders of permits or leases in the Jarbidge Field Office remained on the list regardless of their level of participation.

- Twin Falls Rotary Club (February 2007);
- Three Creek Good Road District (March 2007);
- Twin Falls Optimist Club (April 2007);
- Idaho Conservation League, The Wilderness Society, Idaho Rivers United (June 2007);
- Castleford Men's Club (July 2007);
- Magic Valley ATV Riders, Inc. (February 2008);
- Twin Falls Monarch Lions Club (September 2010);
- Magic Valley ATV Riders (October 2010); and
- The Wilderness Society and Idaho Conservation League (February 2011).

In addition, BLM staff engaged in regular coordination with representatives of the Plaintiffs and Intervenor Western Watersheds Project v. Ellis et al. (Case No. CV-04-181-S-BLW) (D. Idaho). BLM managers and staff have also been in regular contact with program leads from the Idaho BLM State Office as well as the Idaho BLM State Leadership.

5.6 PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THE DRAFT RMP/EIS

The Draft RMP/EIS was published and released in September 2010. On September 3, 2010, the US Environmental Protection Agency and the BLM published a Notice of Availability in the *Federal Register*, which notified the public of the availability of the Draft RMP/EIS and solicited written public comments during the 90-calendar-day review period that ended on December 2, 2010.

The BLM issued a press release on September 3, 2010 which announced the availability of the Draft RMP/EIS and that five open houses would be held. The BLM also provided in the press release instructions on how access electronic, CD-ROM or hard copies of the document, and how to submit public comments. On that same day, the Draft RMP/EIS was available for downloading from the Idaho BLM Web site at http://www.blm.gov/id/st/en/prog/planning/jarbidge_resource.html. The BLM distributed paper and CD-ROM copies of the Draft RMP/EIS to approximately 620 parties, including elected officials, regulatory agencies, and members of the public. The BLM accommodated additional requests for paper or electronic copies of the Draft RMP/EIS after the initial distribution.

Open houses were held in Glens Ferry, ID, Twin Falls, ID, Three Creek, ID, Boise, ID, and Elko, NV during the 90-day public review period. Each open house featured displays, maps, handouts, and interdisciplinary team resource specialists who provided information and answered questions. A total of 91 people attended the open houses (Table 5-3).

Table 5-3. Draft RMP/EIS Open House Schedule and Attendance

Location	Date	Number of Attendees
Glens Ferry, ID	September 21, 2010	6
Twin Falls, ID	September 22, 2010	28
Three Creek, ID	September 23, 2010	22
Boise, ID	September 28, 2010	25
Elko, NV	October 6, 2010	10

On October 22, 2010, the BLM issued a press release announcing that the public comment period on the Draft RMP/EIS would be extended an additional 60 days. On December 1, 2010, the US Environmental Protection Agency and the BLM published a Notice of Extension of Public Comment Period in the *Federal Register*, which notified the public that the comment period for the Draft RMP/EIS was extended until January 31, 2011.

The comment period closed on January 31, 2011. All written comments sent before 12:00 AM on February 1, 2011 were accepted as official comments. These included those sent by US mail postmarked on January 31, 2011, and e-mail messages and facsimiles sent on January 31, 2011, regardless of when they were received. Some comments were duplicated with an electronic mail message and a letter submitted via US mail. Identical comments from the same party were considered only once.

The BLM received more than 28,000 letters, faxes, and emails from individuals, organizations, industry associations, and state and local agencies. Most of the letters (27,715 of them) were form letters.

The Jarbidge RMP Interdisciplinary team reviewed every letter, fax, and email and identified both substantive and non-substantive comments during the content analysis process. Every comment was read and considered. Some comments were combined with similar comments, while other comments were modified slightly for clarity.

A total of 1,100 comments were responded to by the BLM (Appendix P contains these comments and the BLM's responses). Each comment was categorized into one of the 51 categories. Table 5.4 displays a summary of categories receiving the most public comments.

Table 5-4. Public Comment Summary.

Category	Number of Comments
Wildlife	103
Livestock Grazing	94
Special Status Wildlife	75
Energy Development	88
Upland Vegetation	86
Land Tenure/Land Use Authorizations	51
Wildland Fire Management	51
Wild Horses	51
Recreation	51

5.7 LIST OF PREPARERS

Table 5-5 contains a list of the individuals who participated in the preparation of the Jarbidge RMP/EIS.

Table 5-5. List of Preparers

Name	Title	Education/Experience	Document
Core Team			
Heidi Whitlach	Supervisory Natural Resource Specialist (RMP Project Manager)	BS Forest Management MS Forest Resources	Proposed RMP/Final EIS
Aimee D.K. Betts	Supervisory Natural Resource Specialist (RMP Project Manager)	BS Biology and History PhD Ecosystem Science	Draft RMP/EIS
Michael (Mike) Aoi	Fire Planner	BS Computer Science	Proposed RMP/Final EIS & Draft RMP/EIS
Lisa Claxton	Realty Specialist	BS Technology of Agricultural Science	Proposed RMP/Final EIS
Kenneth (Ken) Crane	Supervisory Rangeland Management Specialist	BS Range Management MS Range Management	Proposed RMP/Final EIS & Draft RMP/EIS
Kelly Fischer	Natural Resource Specialist (Writer/Editor)	BS Range and Forest Management	Proposed RMP/Final EIS
Katharine (Kate) Forster	Fisheries Biologist	BS Fisheries	Proposed RMP/Final EIS & Draft RMP/EIS
Michael Haney	Wildlife Biologist	BS Wildlife Biology MS Wildlife Biology	Proposed RMP/Final EIS
Julienne (Julie) Hilty	Botanist	BS Biology MS Plant Ecology and Soil Science	Draft RMP/EIS
James (Jim) Klott	Wildlife Biologist	BS Wildlife Resources MS Zoology	Proposed RMP/Final EIS & Draft RMP/EIS
Amanda Nisula	Writer/Editor	BA Political Science MPA	Draft RMP/EIS
Arnold (Arnie) Pike	Supervisory Rangeland Management Specialist	BS Range Management	Draft RMP/EIS
Ivon (Bonnie) Ross	GIS Specialist	15 years' experience	Proposed RMP/Final EIS & Draft RMP/EIS
Jeffrey (Jeff) Ross	Archaeologist	BA Anthropology	Proposed RMP/Final EIS & Draft RMP/EIS
Thomas Stewart	Botanist	BS Wildlife and Wildlands Conservation MS Wildlife and Wildlands Conservation	Proposed RMP/Final EIS
William (Max) Yingst	Outdoor Recreation Planner	BA General	Proposed RMP/Final EIS & Draft RMP/EIS
Support Team			
Daniel (Dan) Armichardy	Fisheries Biologist	BS Fish and Wildlife MS Biology	Draft RMP/EIS
John Ash	Natural Resource Specialist	BS Biology/Chemistry/ Forestry MS Range and Soils	Draft RMP/EIS
William (Brandon) Brown	Fire Use Specialist	BS Zoology	Draft RMP/EIS

Name	Title	Education/Experience	Document
Support Team			
Richard (Rich) Bupp	Recreation Technician	AAS Water Resource Management BS Agricultural Systems Management	Draft RMP/EIS
Kimberly Cook	Administrative Assistant	AA Liberal Arts	Draft RMP/EIS
Forrest Griggs	Geologist	BS Geology	Draft RMP/EIS
Rachael Gardner	Administrative Assistant	AA Liberal Arts AA Business	Proposed RMP/Final EIS
Sheri Hagwood	Botanist	BS Botany MS Botany	Draft RMP/EIS
Jennifer Mata	Fire Ecologist	BS Range Management/ Vegetation Ecology	Draft RMP/EIS
Nicole Oke	Administrative Assistant	BA Communication	Proposed RMP/Final EIS & Draft RMP/EIS
Christina Paulos	Administrative Assistant		Draft RMP/EIS
Fred Pence	Realty Specialist	BS Geography and Industrial Technology	Draft RMP/EIS
Cassandra (Cassie) Skinner	GIS Specialist	BS Biology	Draft RMP/EIS
Daniel (Dan) Strickler	Rangeland Management Specialist	BS Rangeland Resources BS Crop and Soil Science	Draft RMP/EIS
Heather Tiel-Nelson	Public Affairs Specialist	BS Communications	Proposed RMP/Final EIS & Draft RMP/EIS
Cooperating Agency Representative			
Jeff Cook	Outdoor Recreation Analyst, Idaho Department of Parks and Recreation	BS Wildland Recreation Management	Draft RMP/EIS
Erik Kriwox	Senior Resource Specialist, Idaho Department of Lands	BS Agricultural Science and Technology	Draft RMP/EIS
Mike McDonald	Environmental Staff Biologist, Idaho Department of Fish and Game	BS Biology MS Biology	Draft RMP/EIS
Kevin Wright	Rangeland Management Specialist, Idaho State Department of Agriculture	BS Wildlife and Range Management MPA	Draft RMP/EIS
Mike Wissenbach	Environmental Protection Specialist, Hagerman Fossil Beds National Monument	BS Forestry MS Forest Resources	Draft RMP/EIS
Social and Economic Analysis			
Henry Eichman	Economist, USFS TEAMS Enterprise	BA Biology MS Agricultural and Resource Economics	Proposed RMP/Final EIS & Draft RMP/EIS
Mariah Evans	Associate Professor, University of Nevada-Reno	PhD Sociology	Draft RMP/EIS
Richard L. Gardner	Economist, Bootstrap Solutions	BS Resource Development MS Natural Resource Economics PhD Natural Resource Economics	Draft RMP/EIS

Name	Title	Education/Experience	Document
Social and Economic Analysis			
Thomas Harris	Professor, Department Chair, State Specialist, University of Nevada-Reno	BBA Economics and Finance MS Agricultural Economics PhD Agricultural Economics	Draft RMP/EIS
John V. Martin	Economist, Martin Economics	BS Agricultural and Natural Resource Economics MS Agricultural Business Management	Draft RMP/EIS
Paul R. Zelus	Sociologist, Zelus Associates	BA Classical Languages MA Sociology PhD Organizational Sociology	Draft RMP/EIS